

**Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
January 5, 2022**

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
<u>A-029-21-22</u> : To replace first and second floor windows on an existing two-story addition at the rear of a single family dwelling.	951 Park Avenue	4-0-0	Approved
<u>A-030-21-22</u> : To convert floors 4 through 12 from office to residential units which will include the removal of an existing skylight atrium and vertical exhaust shafts and the addition of amenity space at the rooftop level.	126 E Main Street	Held at the request of the applicant	
<u>A-028-21-22</u> : To install a pool in the rear of a single family dwelling; to replace existing driveway; to replace and reduce the height of a portion of the existing fence; to reconstruct side stair and landing.	16 Strathallan Park	4-0-0	Approved in part; Held in part
<u>A-031-21-22</u> : To remove four (4) existing original steel frame single pane exterior window units and install new window units to provide a uniform window appearance on the East elevation of the Rochester Museum and Science Center; to remove the existing tinted glass in (6) existing exterior windows on the east elevation of the building.	657 East Avenue	4-0-0	Approved
<u>A-032-21-22</u> : To install 4.21 kW solar-integrated roof plus one (1) powerwall energy storage system.	67 Atkinson Street	4-0-0	Approved

Attendance:

Board Members Present: C. Carretta, G. Gamm, *W. Marshall Jr., V. Sanchez, K. Solberg

*William Marshall Jr. was present but did not deliberate or vote on the presented cases.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
February 2, 2022

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
<u>A-033-21-22</u> : To remove perpendicular parking off the main entry driveway; to reorient the service drive; to remove existing angled parking off of the existing service drive; to add seven parking spaces to existing parking lot; to install dumpster screening; to place gravel service drive with lawn; and to replace overhead electrical link with a buried service.	1010 East Avenue	7-0-0	Approved
<u>A-034-21-22</u> : To legalize the replacement of nine windows.	95 Troup Street	6-0-1 [^]	Approved
<u>A-035-21-22</u> : To construct two 4-story multifamily buildings; to remove existing trees; to reconfigure existing parking and routing; and to construct additional parking areas.	1100 South Goodman Street	Conceptual review only.	
<u>A-036-21-22</u> : To legalize the replacement of six windows on the side and rear of the building.	20 Buckingham Street	6-0-0 [†]	Denied*
<u>A-037-21-22</u> : To install egress window to proposed lower level apartment unit on south elevation of building.	30 Edgerton Street	6-0-0 [†]	Approved on Condition*

Attendance:

Board Members Present: E. Cain, C. Carretta, G. Gamm, D. Matthews, W. Marshall, V. Sanchez, K. Solberg

[^] David Matthews abstained from hearing, deliberating, and voting on this case.

[†] William Marshall did not hear, deliberate, or vote on these cases.

***A-036-21-22**: The Board denied the applicant's request to legalize the replacement of six windows. They provided the applicant with an alternative solution, specifically that the applicant submits a window replacement proposal following the provisions outlined in the Preservation Board's guidelines. Any future application should include acceptable window materials and types as specified in the guidelines and the proposed windows should match the color and light configuration of the existing windows.

***A-037-21-22**: The Board approved the applicant's request to install an egress window to a proposed lower level apartment unit on condition that the proposed window be composed of fiberglass material.

**Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
March 2, 2022**

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-020-21-22: To replace an existing interior generator with an exterior diesel generator within an enclosed storage area on the west side of the site.	232 Mill Street	4-0-0	Approved on Condition*
A-038-21-22: To legalize the installation of three (3) A/C units and install two (2) screening fences on the north side of the "Bank of America" building.	669-675 Park Avenue	Held by the Board for additional information.	
A-039-21-22: To install a single faced aluminum composite panel sign for "Neno's."	691-695 Park Avenue	4-0-0	Approved
A-040-21-22: To install a projecting sign on the northeast corner of the building for "933 The U."	911-913 University Avenue	Held by the Board for additional information.	

Attendance:

Board Members Present: E. Cain, C. Carretta, G. Gamm, V. Sanchez

***A-037-21-22:** The Board approved the applicant's request to replace an existing interior generator with an exterior diesel generator within an enclosed storage area on the west side of the site on condition that a black metal fence and double gate be installed to screen the mechanical equipment. This fence should be 5' in height, positioned in the same location as the current wooden fence, and be similar in design to the ornamental fencing presented in the application. Final design to be approved by the Manager of Zoning.

³**A-008-21-22:** The applicant presented revised materials to the Board changing their proposed roofing material from asphalt to simulated slate. The Board approves the applicant's request to replace an existing slate roof on a multifamily dwelling with DaVinci architectural grade synthetic simulated slate products to match the scale and color of the original roof.

⁴**A-045-21-22:** The Board approved this application on condition that the replacement roof be constructed with fiberglass-based shingles that replicate the original cedar roof to the extent possible within the product line presented.

***A-047-21-22:** This application requires additional zoning review for compliance.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
April 6, 2022

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-040-21-22: To install a projecting sign on the northeast corner of the building for "933 The U."	911-913 University Avenue	5-0-0	Approved
A-042-21-22: To install HVAC condenser and landscaped screening on the southern side of a single family dwelling.	45 Oliver Street	5-0-0	Approved on Condition ¹
A-043-21-22: To remove asphalt shingles and replace with vinyl siding and to replace deteriorated window trim.	41 Vick Park A	5-0-0	Approved on Condition ²
A-008-21-22: To replace an existing slate roof on a multifamily dwelling with asphalt shingles.	56 Berkeley St	4-0-1 [^]	Approved on Condition ³
A-044-21-22: To install a fence along the driveway; to install landscaping with a patio and water feature; to install low voltage transformer and associated lighting; and to resurface existing asphalt driveway.	951 Park Av	Held at the request of the applicant.	
A-045-21-22: To remove existing cement tile roofing and replace with fiberglass-based shingle roofing on a multifamily dwelling.	88 Berkeley St	5-0-0	Approved on Condition ⁴
A-047-21-22: To install 25 non-illuminated post and panel wayfinding signs throughout the Rochester Museum & Science Center campus.	657 East Avenue	5-0-0	Approved*
A-046-21-22: To construct a five-unit residential building on the existing parking lot.	1545 East Av	Conceptual review only.	

Attendance:

Board Members Present: E. Cain, C. Carretta, G. Gamm, V. Sanchez, K. Solberg

[^]Boardmember Sanchez abstained from hearing, deliberating, and voting on this case.

¹**A-042-21-22:** The Board approved this application on the condition that a fourth planting is installed in order to provide full screening of the proposed condenser unit.

²**A-043-21-22:** The applicant presented revised materials to the Board changing their proposed siding material from vinyl siding to Hardie Plank fiber cement siding. The Board approved the applicant's request to remove asphalt shingles. When the asphalt shingles are removed, if the original clapboard siding is in a condition to be repaired, the Board prefers the original clapboard siding be restored. If the original clapboard is not salvageable, the Board approves replacement of the clapboard siding with Hardie Plank fiber cement siding to match the depth and reveal of the original clapboard siding. The Board approves the applicant's request to replace deteriorated window trim on the condition that the replacement trim replicates the original trim and is comprised of durable wood or Hardie Plank fiber cement trim.

³**A-008-21-22:** The applicant presented revised materials to the Board changing their proposed roofing material from asphalt to simulated slate. The Board approves the applicant's request to replace an existing slate roof on a multifamily dwelling with DaVinci architectural grade synthetic simulated slate products to match the scale and color of the original roof.

⁴**A-045-21-22:** The Board approved this application on condition that the replacement roof be constructed with fiberglass-based shingles that replicate the original cedar roof to the extent possible within the product line presented.

***A-047-21-22:** This application requires additional zoning review for compliance.

**Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
May 4, 2022**

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-044-21-22: To install a fence along the driveway; to install landscaping with a patio and water feature; to install low voltage transformer and associated lighting; and to resurface existing asphalt driveway.	951 Park Av	4-0-0	Approved on Condition*
A-051-21-22: To replace railing, framing beams, deck boards, and stairs on porch and to replace metal wrapping around columns with PVC material.	1197-1199 Park Av	4-0-0	Hold
A-052-21-22: To remove existing tree and construct garage in rear of building.	2 Grove Pl	4-0-0	Hold
A-053-21-22: To replace 354 original wood windows with simulated divided lite aluminum-clad wood windows.	34 South Goodman St	Held at the request of the applicant	
A-054-21-22: To replace 75 original wood single pane windows with double pane aluminum-clad wood windows.	246 Park Av	Held at the request of the applicant	
A-055-21-22: To install attached building sign for "TES Staffing."	600 Park Av	4-0-0	Approved
A-056-21-22: To install two double faced illuminated cabinets for "Char Steak & Lounge" to existing monument sign.	546 East Av	4-0-0	Approved
A-035-21-22: To construct two 4-story multifamily buildings; to remove existing trees; to reconfigure existing parking and routing; and to construct additional parking areas.	1100 South Goodman St	4-0-0	Approved

Attendance:

Board Members Present: C. Carretta, G. Gamm, D. Matthews, V. Sanchez

* **A-044-21-22:** The Board approved the application on the condition that pavers used in the driveway apron be genuine fired brick.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
June 1, 2022

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-024-21-22: To legalize the front porch steps and railings, and the painting of the porch which was previously not painted, on the front of a multi-family dwelling.	34 Vick Park B	4-0-0	Approved with Conditions ¹
A-038-21-22: To legalize the installation of three (3) A/C units and install two (2) screening fences on the north side of the “Bank of America” building.	669-675 Park Avenue	4-0-0	Approved with Conditions ²
A-053-21-22: To replace 354 original wood windows with simulated divided lite aluminum-clad wood windows.	34 S Goodman St	4-0-0	Approved
A-054-21-22: To replace 75 original wood single pane windows with double pane aluminum-clad wood windows.	246 Park Av	3-1-0	No Action ³
A-051-21-22: To replace railing, framing beams, deck boards, and stairs on porch and to replace metal wrapping around columns with PVC material.	1197-1199 Park Av	4-0-0	Approved with Conditions ⁴
A-058-21-22: To replace 15 double hung windows, 3 casement windows, and 1 circular window original to the single family dwelling structure and to remove two (2) trees.	616 Park Av	4-0-0	Approved in part; Held in part ⁵
A-059-21-22: To replace existing metal roof and install attached exterior sign for “Starbucks.”	646 Park Av	Case Held	
A-060-21-22: To install mounted plaque building identification sign.	40 Franklin St	Case Held	
A-061-21-22: To legalize the three (3) condenser units on the corner of Spring Street and Goldsmith Place and install Lennox ductless 3:1 system including one (1) outdoor condenser and three (3) indoor heads along South Washington Street.	130 Spring St	Case Held	

Attendance:

Board Members Present: E. Cain, C. Carretta, V. Sanchez, K. Solberg

¹**A-024-21-22:** The Board approved the presented application on the following conditions: the railing, step width, and tapered walkway from sidewalk match the specifications on page 22 of the Staff Report; steps, decking, and all related elements be constructed of pine or fir species of wood and be painted or stained; and paint be removed from stone foundation.

²**A-038-21-22:** The Board approved the presented application on the condition that all A/C condenser units be relocated to the rear of the building and confined to one (1) parking space with bollards surrounding the units.

³**A-054-21-22**: Per §120-185E, a concurring vote of four members shall be necessary for any action by the Board. As there was no concurring vote, the hearing for this case was adjourned to the next scheduled meeting on July 6, 2022.

⁴**A-051-21-22**: The Board approved the presented application on the following conditions: the nosing, full tread, and railing treatment and attachment match the specifications in Exhibit A of the Staff Report; a pine species of wood be used for all trim and column wrap; the railing include wider spindles matching the surrounding historic character; and block foundation be stained or painted.

⁵**A-058-21-22**: The Board approved the applicant's request to remove two (2) trees from the rear yard of the subject property. The Board held the applicant's request to replace 19 windows for additional information from the applicant.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
July 6, 2022

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-046-21-22: To construct a five-unit residential building on the existing parking lot. This is a conceptual review only.	1545 East Av	Case Held by the Board	
A-052-21-22: To remove existing tree and construct garage in rear of building.	2 Grove Pl	Case Held by the Board	
A-059-21-22: To renovate storefront façade for tenant space #646.	646 Park Av	Case Held due to expanded scope of work	
A-060-21-22: To install mounted plaque building identification sign.	40 Franklin St	5-0-0	Approved
A-061-21-22: To legalize the three (3) condenser units on the corner of Spring Street and Goldsmith Place and install Lennox ductless 3:1 system including one (1) outdoor condenser and three (3) indoor heads along South Washington Street.	130 Spring St	5-0-0	Approved on C
A-001-22-23: To re-face existing hanging metal non-illuminated sign for “Merkato Ethiopian Market & Grocery”	508 W Main St	5-0-0	Approved
A-002-22-23: To install four (4) wall-mounted electric car chargers on existing retaining wall in existing parking lot.	546 East Av	Approved via Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness	
A-003-22-23: To remove a Norway Maple tree along Park Avenue side of property near driveway.	8 East Blvd	Approved via Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness	
A-004-22-23: To replace storefront windows, framing, and knee wall and to install window decal, attached sign, and awning.	645 Park Av	5-0-0	Approved on Condition
A-005-22-23: To establish an alternative sign program for the “Jefferson Avenue Seventh-Day Adventist Church” temporary leased space.	36 King St	5-0-0	Approved

Attendance:

Board Members Present: C. Carretta, G. Gamm, H. Diodato, V. Sanchez and K. Solberg.

¹**A-046-21-22**: The Board held the applicant's request to construct a five-unit residential building on the existing parking lot at 1545 East Avenue. This is for the applicant to present more information on the conceptual design and to address the concern raised by the Board on your design concept as was presented on July 6, 2022.

²**A-052-21-22**: The Board held the applicant's request to remove existing tree and construct garage in rear of building at 2 Grove Place. This is to provide an opportunity for the applicant to present more information and to revise the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. The comments of the RPB that should be addressed in the revisions to the application.

³**A-059-21-22**: The application to renovate storefront façade for tenant space #646 was held by Staff due to expanded scope of work. The application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for subject property 646 Park Avenue will be reviewed at the Board's next hearing scheduled for August 3, 2022.

⁴**A-060-21-22**: The Board approved the presented application to install mounted plaque building identification sign at 40 Franklin Street. The Board determined that the size and placement of the sign is appropriate for the character of the landmark building and surrounding area. Additionally, the Board determined the font, colors, and overall design were appropriate as they are consistent with RIT's branding. The proposed sign meets the preservation guidelines and does not create a significant visual impact.

⁵**A-061-21-22**: The Board approved the applicant's request to legalize the three (3) condenser units on the corner of Spring Street and Goldsmith Place and install Lennox ductless 3:1 system including one (1) outdoor condenser and three (3) indoor heads along South Washington Street on condition that; all condenser units shall be screened with evergreen landscaping at a height that conceals the units from view and the new proposed unit and associated landscaping shall be centered on the building façade. The Board reviewed this case at their June 1, 2022 hearing and held the application to provide the applicant with an opportunity to provide them with additional information regarding the placement of the proposed unit and screening of the existing units.

⁶ **A-001-22-23**: The Board approved the applicant's request to re-face existing hanging metal non-illuminated sign for "Merkato Ethiopian Market & Grocery" at 508 W Main Street. The Board confirmed that the proposed sign does not obscure any significant architectural features of the building and is composed of appropriate materials. Signs on neighboring buildings are similar in scale. The graphics, colors, and fonts selected accurately reflect the applicant's business. The Board supported the application as presented stating that the proposed sign is consistent with the preservation guidelines.

⁹ **A-004-22-23**: The Board approved with condition the applicant's request to replace storefront windows, framing, and knee wall and to install window decals, attached sign, and awning at 645 Park Avenue. The Board affirmed that the ductwork must be brushed steel or darker in color to reduce visual impact. The Board determined that the design is appropriate and comply with the preservation guidelines. The materials are of a high quality and consistent with the surrounding historic character area. In order to reduce its visual impact.

¹⁰ **A-005-22-23**: The Board approved the applicant's request to establish an alternative sign program for the "Jefferson Avenue Seventh-Day Adventist Church" temporary leased space. The Board noted that a sign made of higher quality materials with a more streamlined design would be appropriate for a permanent sign. However, the Board determined that the design and materials presented are appropriate for a temporary sign in this area.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
August 3, 2022

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-052-21-22: To remove existing tree and construct garage in rear of building.	2 Grove Place.	Case Held by Staff.	
A-059-21-22: To renovate storefront façade for tenant space #646.	646 Park Avenue.	5-0-0	Approved
A-006-22-23: To legalize attached sign for “Aldaskeller Wine Co.”.	285-291 Gregory Street.	5-0-0	Approved
A-007-22-23: To install a concrete front patio for outdoor seating and install fence in front yard for “The Classic.”	263 Park Avenue.	Case Held by the Board.	
A-008-22-23: To legalize the removal of a tree within the front yard of a multifamily dwelling.	1450 East Avenue.	Case Held by the Board for more information.	

Attendance:

Board Members Present: C. Carretta, G. Gamm, E. Cain, H. Diodato and D. Matthews.

¹ **A-052-21-22:** The application was held by the staff for applicant to present more information as requested by the Board.

² **A-059-21-22:** The Board approved the presented application to renovate storefront façade for tenant space at 646 Park Avenue. The Board determined that the new design and façade of the proposed renovation as presented is appropriate for the character of the surrounding buildings. The design included the following elements: matte black metal coping covering top of parapet wall, Accoya wood siding below metal coping, metal awning, mural on new brick wall, New windows and Sconces on entry columns.

³ **A-006-22-23:** The Board approved the application to legalize attached the sign for “Aldaskeller Wine Co.” at 285-291 Gregory Street. The Board discovered that the 24” x 192” sign did not obscure any significant architectural features of the building and is composed of appropriate materials. Signs on neighboring buildings are similar in scale. The graphics, colors, and fonts selected accurately reflect the applicant’s business. The font design and colors are consistent with the business branding. The awnings, gooseneck lacing, cornices and building façade will remain unchanged.

⁴ **A-007-22-23:** Per §120-185E, a concurring vote of four members shall be necessary for any action by the Board. As there was no concurring vote, the hearing for this case was adjourned to the next scheduled meeting on September 7, 2022.

⁵ **A-008-22-23:** The Board held the application to legalize the removal of a tree within the front yard of a multifamily dwelling for more information. Requested information are as follows: Licensed Arborist letter on the condition of existing trees on the property, exact number of trees removed and their location, planting plan, Species of trees to be planted as replacement, scaled site plan with landscaping (trees, location, etc.), approved the applicant’s request to remove two (2) trees from the rear yard of the subject property.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
September 7, 2022

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-007-22-23: To install a front patio for outdoor seating and install fence in front yard for “The Classic.”	263 Park Avenue	5-0-0	Approved
A-012-22-23: To renovate the Park at Granite Mills Commons.	82 Brown’s Race	5-0-0	Case Approved in Part and Held in Part by the Board
A-013-22-23: To legalize front porch railing and installation of solar lights.	774-776 University Avenue.	5-0-0	Case Approved on Condition
A-014-22-23: To install replacement windows in lieu of restoring existing windows (alteration to previous certificate of appropriateness approval)	67-89 Canal Street	5-0-0	Approved
A-015-22-23: To construct an outdoor patio and pavilion at the Witmer House	630 Mt Hope Avenue	Case Held by Staff for October 5, 2022.	
A-016-22-23: To legalize storefront renovation and to reface existing sign for “Leonore”	703 Park Avenue	5-0-0	Approved
A-017-22-23: To install fifteen (15) new aluminum clad wood windows to replace existing fifteen (15) unapproved vinyl windows.	28 Buckingham Street	5-0-0	Approved

Attendance:

Board Members Present: C. Carretta, G. Gamm, H. Diodato, V. Sanchez and K. Solberg.

¹**A-007-22-23:** The Board approved the presented application to install a front patio for outdoor seating and install fence in front yard for “The Classic.” The applicant submitted an amended design which includes the following details; patio 300 square feet in size, surface will be constructed with natural/traditional materials, surface will be permeable, the existing walkway and steps will remain and the pavers will meet the sides, the patio will be raised from 7” to 11” along the sidewalk with a retaining wall base, 16” mulch border will remain between the sidewalk and patio and between patio and driveway, 12” mulch border will separate the patio from the building and a 2’ and 6” to 3’ tall back fence (page 18 of staff report) will be installed along the edge of the patio facing the sidewalk. The Board determined that the new design and the proposed natural/traditional materials for the patio surface is appropriate to the historic character of the neighborhood and meet the Board guidelines.

²**A-012-22-23:** The Board approved the applicant’s presentation to renovate the Park at Granite Mills Commons in Part and Held in Part. The Board approved the applicant’s request for the followings; removal and reinstallation of park pavers, removal and replacement of benches and removal of tree pit edging and replacement with metal edging and new mulch. The Board held the applicant’s request to remove the 35’ tall light and replacement with 18’ decorative light. The Board requested the applicant to consider alternate design(s) that will maintain or enhance the current lighting at the Park rather than moving it to the center. The Board required the applicant to present such design to the Board when it is available.

³**A-013-22-23:** The applicant’s request to legalize front porch railing and installation of solar lights was approved by the

Board on condition that the applicant install a symmetric railing on the right side and remove all solar light from the staircase. The Board observed that the solar lightings on the stairwell boards are inappropriate and that they distort the historic character of the area.

⁴**A-014-22-23**: The Board approved the presented application to install replacement windows in lieu of restoring existing windows (alteration to previous certificate of appropriateness approval) by the applicant. The Board members confirmed that out of the proposed 331 windows originally planned for restoration, due to exposure of the windows to the elements and original floored design based on sizing, only 36 are restorable and in summary, only 295 will be replaced plus initial 583 windows that were originally planned to be replaced. Board members added that the replacement windows meet the requirements of the Preservation Board Design guidelines for replacement. The Board determined that the proposal improves the quality of the surrounding neighborhood.

⁵**A-015-22-23** Per §120-185E, a concurring vote of four members shall be necessary for any action by the Board. As there was no concurring vote, the hearing for this case was adjourned to the next scheduled meeting on October 5, 2022.

⁶**A-016-22-23**: The Board approved the applicant's application to legalize storefront renovation and to reface existing sign for "Leonore". The Board requested that the title of the project on the Staff Report be modified to avoid it being misleading since no construction exist on the site. The Board concluded that the proposed project, as shown on the drawings submitted, is of high quality and conform to the Board's preservation guidelines.

⁷**A-017-22-23**: The application to install fifteen (15) new aluminum clad wood windows to replace existing fifteen (15) unapproved vinyl windows as submitted by the applicant was approved by the Board. The Board found that the proposed aluminum clad wood windows are high quality products and conform to the Board's preservation guidelines. The replacement windows will create no substantial visual change to the building and will not detract from the historical character of the neighborhood.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
October 5, 2022

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-012-22-23: To renovate the Park at Granite Mills Commons.	82 Brown's Race.	5-0-0	Approved
A- 018-22-23: To create a landscape at front and back lawn, removal of two (2) dead small-medium height juniper trees for pathway creation.	64 Barrington Street.	5-0-0	Approved
A- 019-22-23: To install a stair case and two steel bollards at the north side for additional egress to an existing building.	53 Canal Street.	5-0-0	Approved
A- 020-22-23: To construct a garden area with ten (10) raised planting beds, a 20' x 20' shelter classroom and a 7' x 10'x 8' pre-manufactured resin storage.	657 East Avenue	5-0-0	Case Approved in Part and Held in Part by the Board
A- 021-22-23: To repair an existing damaged porch columns, second floor framing and re-roofing of the west side of building entrance	10 Atkinson Street	4-0-0	Case Approved on Condition
A- 022-22-23: To install a new 85' long and 6' high cedar wood lattice-top fence between 6 and 8 Arnold Park	8 Arnold Park	5-0-0	Approved
A-015-22-23: To construct an outdoor patio and pavilion at the Witmer House.	630 Mt Hope Avenue	4-0-0	Case Approved in Part and Held in Part by the Board

Attendance:

Board Members Present: C. Carretta, K. Solberg, H. Diodato and F. Uloth and V. Sanchez

Case 5/A-021-22-23, Board Members Present: F. Uloth, C. Carretta, H. Diodato and K. Solberg.

Case 7/ A-015-22-23, Board Members Present: K. Solberg, C. Carretta, H. Diodato and F. Uloth.

¹ **A-012-22-23:** The Board approved the applicant's request to install three (3) wall mounted lamps on the buildings to the south, east and west of the Park at 82 Brown's Race as shown on page 11 of the Staff Report and two (2) light poles at the center and north of the Park as shown on pages 10, 21 and 22, and a sample on page 14 of the Staff Report. The Board found that the installation of additional illumination at the Park as proposed by the applicant is an improved upgrade from one (1) lamp post earlier proposed by the applicant in their previous appearance at the Preservation Board hearing on September 7, 2022. The Board concluded that the new lighting design is appropriate and will provide adequate illumination to the Park and will not have adverse effect on the historic character of the District.

² **A-018-22-23:** The Board approved the applicant's request to create a landscape at front and back lawn, removal of two (2) dead small-medium height juniper trees for pathway creation at 64 Barrington Street as shown on pages 10, 11, 14 and 15 of the Staff Report. The Board found that the propose plan is of high quality, environmental friendly and conform to the Board's design guidelines. The landscape architecture will create no substantial visual change to the building and will not detract from the historic character of the neighborhood.

³ **A-019-22-23:** The applicant's request to install a staircase and two steel bollards at the north side for additional egress to an existing building at 53 Canal Street was approved. The Board noted on page 13 of the staff report there was no adequate description of the proposed guardrail materials. The Board recommend a 4-inch vertical tubular steel guard rail in compliance with New York State Building Code. The Board also stated that the applicant's plan complies with preservation guidelines and confirm that the proposed staircase installation will not create any substantial visual change to the building and will not detract from the historic character of the neighborhood.

⁴ **A-020-22-23:** The Board approved in part and held in part the applicant's request to construct a garden area with ten (10) raised planting beds, a 20' x 20' shelter classroom and a 7' x 10' x 8' pre-manufactured resin storage shed at 657 East Avenue. The Board found that the construction of a garden area with ten (10) raised planting/garden beds and a 20' x 20' shelter classroom is appropriate for Planned Development District #4 and in conformity with the historic character of the Preservation District and matches the nearby surroundings. The Board rejected the applicant's request to construct a 7' x 10' x 8' pre-manufactured resin storage shed because the materials selected (resin) are not in conformity with the Preservation District's guidelines. The Board requested the applicant to consider alternate design(s) and materials that will maintain or enhance the current historic character of the District. The Board required the applicant to present such design to the Board when it is available.

⁵ **A-021-22-23:** The applicant's request to repair existing damaged porch columns, second floor framing and re-roofing of the west side of the building entrance at 10 Atkinson Street as shown on pages 19 and 20 of the Staff Report was approved by the Board on condition that the guard rails shall be wood and match the original. The Board also confirmed that redesigned porch columns and guard rails emulate the surrounding buildings and will create no substantial visual change to the building. The Board confirm that the repair will not detract from the historic character of the neighborhood.

⁶ **A-022-22-23:** The Board approved the applicant's application to install a new 85' long and 6' high cedar wood lattice-top fence between 6 and 8 Arnold Park. The Board determined that the 85' long and 6' high cedar-wood attic-top fence proposed by the applicant is appropriate to the historic character of the neighborhood and meets the Preservation Board guidelines. Additionally, the Board determined the design is consistent with walls/fences in the surrounding area.

⁷ **A-017-22-23:** The Board approved in part and held in part the applicant's request to construct an outdoor patio and pavilion at the Witmer house, 630 Mt Hope Avenue. The Board approved the applicant's request to construct a 740 sq-ft "Dining Patio" as labeled on page 18 of the Staff Report matching existing patio in materials and pattern, pavers and ADA walkway with brushed concrete. The Board found that the construction is in conformity with the historic character of the Preservation District and matches the nearby surroundings. The Board rejected the applicant's request to construct a 460 sq-ft pavilion because it is not in conformity with the Preservation District's guidelines. The Board requested the applicant to consider alternate design(s) and materials that will maintain or enhance the current historic character of the District. The Board required the applicant to present such design to the Board when it is available. The Board also requested such design should put into consideration Board's comments, public comments and feedbacks received on the proposed project.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
November 2, 2022

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-020-22-23: To construct a garden area with ten (10) raised planting beds, a 20' x 20' shelter classroom and a 7' x 10'x 8' pre-manufactured resin storage building.	657 East Avenue	7-0-0	Held
A- 024-22-23: To remove and replace existing stairs, handrail, brick pavers and trees.	30 Church Street	7-0-0	Adjourned at the request of the applicant
A- 025-22-23: To remove old single-side railings and install two new symmetric railings on the back porch stairs	22 Strathallan Park	7-0-0	Held
A- 026-22-23: To remove and install symmetric guard railings on wood staircases (1 on Barrington St. and 2 on Park Avenue).	116 Barrington Street	7-0-0	Held
A-027-22-23: To replace an existing sign at the church parking lot	4 Meigs Street	5-2-0	Approved
A- 028-22-23: To install a 96 square foot meditation garden in side yard consisting of rock and pavers to create a "meditation rock" garden	6 Calumet Street	7-0-0	Held
A-029-22-23: To remodel rear attached porch including addition of five (5) windows and interior fire place.	35 Berkeley Street	5-2-0	Approved

Attendance:

Board Members Present: C. Carretta, K. Solberg, E. Cain, F. Uloth, G. Gamm, A. Hinman and V. Sanchez

Case 1/A-020-22-23, Board Members Present: C. Carretta, E. Cain, F. Uloth, G. Gamm, A. Hinman and V. Sanchez

¹ **A-020-22-23:** The Board held the application in order to provide the applicant with an opportunity to present a redesigned storage shed. The Rochester Preservation requested the applicant to provide alternate design(s) with the following characteristics; a roof that mimics the approved shelter, siding that reflects the visible elements of the shelter like weathered cedar or stained cedar, cross arching doors that do not attract attention and are discrete, natural materials that match the materials used for the shelter and the pitch of the shed roof should resemble the pitch of the shelter.

² **A- 024-22-23:** The Board adjourned the application at the request of the applicant.

³ **A- 025-22-23:** The applicant's request to remove old single-side railings and install two new symmetric railings on the back porch stairs was held by the Board. The Rochester Preservation Board requested the applicant to provide the following information; details of redesigned railings that are New York State Building Code compliant, detail concrete steps replacement and railing design that is consistent with the existing railings on the property and resemble the historic character of the neighborhood.

⁴**A-026-22-23:** The Board held the application to provide the applicant with an opportunity to present a redesigned railing on the back porch stairs of the property at 116 Barrington Street. The Rochester Preservation requested the applicant to provide the followings; redesign railings that are New York State Building Code compliant, submit a new proposal to replace the reads on the steps (the flat part) to reflect the historic character of the neighborhood with the overhang rounded (bullnose edge). All three (3) sets of rails could be historic wrought iron or two (2) could be wrought iron and the one on the main entrance at the Park avenue side may replicate the wood elements on the porch.

⁵**A-027-22-23:** The applicant's request to replace an existing sign at the church parking lot at 4 Meigs Street. The Board discovered that the sign did not obscure any significant architectural features of the building and is composed of appropriate materials. The graphics, colors, and fonts selected accurately reflect the applicant's business. The Board supported the application as presented stating that the proposed sign is consistent with the preservation guidelines

⁶**A-028-22-23:** The Board held the applicant's application to install a 96 square foot meditation garden in side yard consisting of rock and pavers to create a "meditation rock" garden. This is for the applicant to provide following information as requested by the Board; explicit description of the scope of work, detailed plans of the "meditation garden" and design/sketches/rendering and the List of proposed materials (concrete, flagstones, bricks, etc.) and layout, including dimensions of the pavers.

⁷**A-029-22-23:** The Board approved in the applicant's request to remodel rear attached porch including addition of five (5) windows and interior fire place. The applicant introduced an addendum to his application on the hearing day by proposing to repurpose an additional two (2) windows on the north side of the porch in addition to the five (5) planned on the south side as shown on pages 20 and 21 of the Staff Report. The Board determined that the design and proposed remodeling of the rear attached porch including the addition of five (5) windows, interior fire place and additional two (2) windows on the north side as presented is appropriate for the character of the surrounding buildings in the Preservation District. Additionally, the Board determined the colors and overall design were appropriate as they are consistent with historic character of the East Avenue Preservation District and buildings in the area. The proposed remodeling meets the preservation guidelines and does not create a significant visual impact.

Rochester Preservation Board Decision Grid
December 7, 2022.

CASE	ADDRESS	RECORD OF VOTE	DECISION
A-015-22-23: To construct an outdoor patio and pavilion at the Witmer House	630 Mt Hope Avenue	6-0-0	Approved
A- 025-22-23: To remove old single-side railings and install two new symmetric railings on the back porch stairs.	22 Strathallan Park	7-0-0	Approved
A- 026-22-23: To remove and install symmetric guard railings on wood staircases (1 on Barrington St. and 2 on Park Av.).	116 Barrington Street	7-0-0	Approved
A-030-22-23: To install approximately 164' x 4' black wrought iron fencing along Troup and South Washington Streets	95 Troup Street	6-0-0	Approved
A-031-22-23: To replace existing two (2) glazed triple windows with no grilles in a single family residence.	30 Vick Park A	7-0-0	Held
A-032-22-23: To legalize the work done on the rear porch of multiple dwelling; includes moving of wood steps from rear porch to grade to provide area at bottom of existing fire escape egress.	9 Buckingham Street	7-0-0	Approved
A-033-22-23: To replace three (3) original windows with three (3) LIFE PELLA aluminum clad wood windows.	1313 Park Avenue	7-0-0	Approved
A-034-22-23: To replace an existing 6' wood dumpster screen/fence with a 6' metal dumpster screen/fence.	232 Mill Street	7-0-0	Approved

Attendance:

Board Members Present: C. Carretta, K. Solberg, F. Uloth, H. Diodato, A. Hinman, V. Sanchez and D. Matthews.

Case 1/A-015-22-23: Board Members Present; K. Solberg, C. Carretta, H. Diodato, A. Hinman, D. Matthews and F. Uloth.

Case4/ A-030-22-23: Board Members Present: C. Carretta, K. Solberg, F. Uloth, H. Diodato, A. Hinman and V. Sanchez