Cultural Resource Management Report
Phase IA Cultural Resource Reconnaissance Survey
for the Proposed Midtown Development Bounded by East Main Street, South Clinton Avenue, East Broad Street, Chestnut Street, Elm Street, Atlas Street, and Euclid Street

RMSC/RHPP PIN 2008.05

City of Rochester
Monroe County
New York
MCD: 05540

Prepared By:
Scott A. Crowder

With Contributions By
Mark W. Ewing

Rochester Museum & Science Center
Regional Heritage Preservation Program
657 East Avenue
Rochester, New York 14607

Submitted To:
Mr. Mark W. Tayrien, AICP
Manager, Planning Services
LaBella Associates, P.C.
300 State Street
Rochester, New York 14614

7 May 2008

Sponsor: Local SEQR
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Management Summary .................................................................................................................................................... iii

I. Project Description ................................................................................................................................................ 1

II. General Project Area ........................................................................................................................................... 1

III. Background Research ........................................................................................................................................ 4

  3.1 Project area soils .............................................................................................................................................. 4
  3.2 Sites within a one-mile radius ........................................................................................................................... 6
  3.3 Historic Development of APE ....................................................................................................................... 8

IV. Sensitivity Assessment ....................................................................................................................................... 10

  4.1 Prehistoric site sensitivity ............................................................................................................................... 10
  4.2 Historic site sensitivity .................................................................................................................................. 10

V. Type and Extent of Disturbance .......................................................................................................................... 10

VI. Testing Recommendations ................................................................................................................................ 10

VII. References ......................................................................................................................................................... 11

## APPENDICES

A. Photographs ......................................................................................................................................................... 12

  Midtown Phase IA Project Map with Photograph Angles ....................................................................................... 13

B. Midtown Figures 4-14 .......................................................................................................................................... 22

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: General project location in Monroe County, New York State ................................................................. 2
Figure 2: Project location on the USGS 7.5’ Rochester East, NY Quadrangle 1971 (Photoinspected 1978) .......... 3
Figure 3: Project location on the NRCS Web Soil Survey of Monroe County, New York .................................... 5
Figure 4: Midtown APE on Plate 7 of the 1875 Hopkins Map of Rochester, New York ........................................ 23
Figure 5: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1892 Sanborn Map of Rochester, New York ...................... 24
Figure 6: Midtown APE and MDS locations on Plates 5 and 6 of the 1900 Lathrop Plat Map of Rochester, New York 25
Figure 7: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1912 Sanborn Map of Rochester, New York ......................... 26
Figure 8: Midtown APE and MDS locations on Plate 2 of the 1918 Hopkins Plat Map of Rochester, New York .... 27
Figure 9: Midtown APE and MDS locations on Plate 2 of the 1926 Hopkins Plat Map of Rochester, New York ..... 28
Figure 10: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1938 Sanborn Map of Rochester, New York .................... 29
Figure 11: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1951 aerial photograph of the City of Rochester ................ 30
Figure 12: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1970 aerial photograph of the City of Rochester ............... 31
Figure 13: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1993 aerial photograph of the City of Rochester ............... 32
Figure 14: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the April 2005 aerial photograph of the City of Rochester .......... 33
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Soil Types Represented within the Project Area ................................................................. 4
Table 2: Archaeological Sites within a One Mile Radius of the Project Area.................................... 6
Table 3: Summary of Known Archaeological Sites by Cultural Affiliation and Site Type .................. 8

LIST OF PHOTOGRAPHS

Photograph 1: General Midtown APE and McCurdy Building along Euclid St., from the corner of Euclid St. and E. Main St., facing south ............................................................ 14
Photograph 2: General Midtown APE and McCurdy Building along E. Main St., from the corner of Euclid St. and E. Main St., facing west ................................................................. 14
Photograph 3: General Midtown APE and current Citizens Bank Building (not part of APE), from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Main St., facing southeast ................................. 15
Photograph 4: General Midtown APE along S. Clinton Ave., from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Main St., facing south ................................................................. 15
Photograph 5: General Midtown APE and Seneca Building along S. Clinton Ave., facing east .............. 16
Photograph 6: General Midtown APE and B. Forman Building along S. Clinton Ave., facing east ............ 16
Photograph 7: General Midtown APE from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Broad St., facing north ........ 17
Photograph 8: General Midtown APE from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Broad St., facing northeast ........ 17
Photograph 9: General Midtown APE from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Broad St., facing east .......... 18
Photograph 10: General Midtown APE along E. Broad St., facing north ............................................ 18
Photograph 11: General Midtown APE along E. Broad St., facing north ............................................ 19
Photograph 12: General Midtown APE along E. Broad St., facing northeast ....................................... 19
Photograph 13: General Midtown APE along Atlas St., facing west .................................................. 20
Photograph 14: General Midtown APE and underground service road access along Atlas St., facing north .... 20
Photograph 15: General Midtown APE along Atlas St., facing southwest .......................................... 21
Photograph 16: General Midtown APE along Euclid St., facing northwest ....................................... 21
MANAGEMENT SUMMARY

A. SHPO Project Review Number: N/A

B. Involved State and Federal Agencies: Local SEQR

C. Phase of Survey: Phase IA Archaeological Resource Reconnaissance Survey

D. Location Information
   Location: Monolithic city block structure consisting of joined buildings of various sizes bounded by East Main Street, South Clinton Avenue, East Broad Street, Chestnut Street, Elm Street, Atlas Street, and Euclid Street
   Minor Civil Division: City of Rochester; MCD 05540
   County: Monroe County, New York

E. Survey Area
   Maximum Length: 259 meters (850 feet)
   Maximum Width: 195 meters (637 feet)
   APE Acres: Approximately 3.6 hectares (8.8 acres)
   Number of Square Meter & Feet Excavated (Phase II, Phase III only): N/A
   Percentage of the Site Excavated (Phase II, Phase III only): N/A

F. USGS 7.5 Minute Quadrangle Map: Rochester East, New York 1971 (Revised 1978)

G. Archaeological Survey Overview
   Number & Interval of Shovel Tests: N/A
   Number & Size of Units: N/A
   Width of Plowed Strips: N/A
   Surface Survey Transect Interval: N/A

H. Results of Archaeological Survey
   Number of & name of prehistoric sites identified: N/A
   Number of & name of historic sites identified: N/A
   Number of & name of sites recommended for Phase II/Avoidance: N/A

I. Results of Architectural Survey
   Number of buildings/structures/cemeteries within project area: 1 –Midtown Plaza* (Monolithic structure composed of many joined buildings)
   Number of buildings/structures/cemeteries adjacent to project area: N/A
   Number of known NR listed/eligible buildings/structures/cemeteries/districts: N/A
   Number of identified eligible buildings/structures/cemeteries/districts: N/A


K. Date of Report: 7 May 2008
I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

This report presents the results of a Phase IA cultural resource reconnaissance survey as part of the preliminary planning for the proposed Midtown redevelopment in the City of Rochester, New York. The Phase IA Cultural Resource Investigations, requested by Mr. Mark W. Tayrien of LaBella Associates, P.C. of Rochester, New York, are in partial compliance with existing state and federal regulations regarding the location, evaluation, and preservation of cultural resources that may suffer adverse impacts from government assisted or permitted construction projects. The project area and Area of Potential Effect (APE) encompass approximately 3.6 hectares (8.8 acres) and is a single monolithic block structure of connected buildings bounded by East Main Street on the north, South Clinton Avenue on the west, East Broad Street to the south, and Chestnut Street, Elm Street, Atlas Street, and Euclid Street on the east. The proposed construction plans are still evolving but to date include a high-rise corporate headquarters tower of approximately 500,000 ft², an associated smaller 5-story structure for PaeTec Holding Corporation likely located in the southern portion of the APE. Additional assorted office, residential, retail, and hospitality buildings may also be added to the development plan pending the results of planning and market studies currently underway. As currently planned, existing subsurface parking garages and the extensive subsurface service road system will be left in place, although a portion of the garage under the current Midtown Tower maybe be demolished to allow for implosion of the tower structure. In all cases the slab at the lowest level of the existing garages will be preserved even if the upper sections of the garage are demolished. All work will occur within the City of Rochester, Monroe County, New York. The maximum survey length from east to west is 195 meters (637 feet) and the total width of surveyed area is 259 meters (850 feet).

The fieldwork summarized in this document was performed under the direct supervision of Mark W. Ewing, Manager, Rochester Museum & Science Center (RMSC), Regional Heritage Preservation Program (RHPP), and also served as editor. Scott A. Crowder served as the project director and is the principal author of this report.

In compliance with the New York State Education Department’s Revised Work Scope Descriptions (March 2005) and National Park Service’s Criteria and Procedures for the Identification of Historic Properties (1990), the area within the project area is considered within the Area of Impact for the purpose of conducting the survey. The results of the research performed for this report do not apply to any territory outside the project area.

II. GENERAL PROJECT AREA

Figure 1 places the project location within Monroe County and New York State. Figure 2 shows the project area on the 1971 (Photoinspected 1978) USGS 7.5’ Rochester East, N. Y. Quadrangle topographic map. Photographs 1 through 16 located in Appendix A demonstrate present land uses and current conditions within the project area.
Figure 1: General project location in Monroe County, New York State
Figure 2: Project location on the USGS 7.5' Rochester East, NY Quadrangle 1971 (Photorevised 1978)
III. BACKGROUND RESEARCH

3.1 Project Area Soils

All of Monroe County was repeatedly covered by ice during the Wisconsin stage of the Pleistocene Epoch, and the present topography of the general project area reflects the waning effects of the Wisconsin glaciation. In addition to the more visible effects of glaciation on the area, soil development and topography were also influenced by the bedrock formations present within the county. The bedrock underlying Monroe County is of sedimentary origin and consists predominantly of sandstones, limestones, dolomites, and shales. These formations provided parent material for some of the soil types within the county and where the bedrock was close to the surface; the topography follows the underlying formation (USDA 1973:169).

The Genesee River flows through the center of Monroe County from south to north and is one of the largest rivers in the state with a total watershed of 2,467 square miles. The project area is situated in the north-central section of Monroe County, specifically in the downtown section of the City of Rochester, within the city block area bounded by West Broad Street to the north, School Alley to the east, and S. Plymouth Avenue to the west (Figure 2). The northern part of the county, including the project APE, lies within a nearly level to gently sloping lake plain which is predominantly the lakebed of glacial Lake Iroquois. The terrain in this lake plain has a gradual slope towards Lake Ontario and contains numerous low ridges and small, circular/elliptical hills which rise from 5 to 50 ft (1.5 to 15 m) above the lake plain (USDA 1973:168). This region is situated within the Erie-Ontario lowlands physiographic province that is characterized by relatively low, flat areas.

The land within the project area is nearly level with an elevation of approximately 155 meters (510 feet) amsl. There is one soil type noted on the Monroe County soil survey map as present within the project area, reflecting human impact on the topography of the project area (Figure 3). The soil in the project area is classified as urban land (USDA 1973:140). A summary of this soil type and its attributes is presented below in Table 1.

Table 1: Soil Type Represented within the Project Area.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Soil Horizon Depth cm (in)</th>
<th>Color</th>
<th>Texture, Inclusions</th>
<th>Slope %</th>
<th>Drainage</th>
<th>Landform</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Urban Land</td>
<td>Urban land consists of areas that have been so altered or obscured by urban works and structures that identification of the soils is not feasible.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Urban Land</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**KEY:**

- **Shade:** Lt – Light, Dk – Dark, V – Very
- **Color:** Brn – Brown, Blk – Black, Gry – Gray, GBrn – Gray Brown, StrBrn – Strong Brown, RBrn – Red Brown, YBrn – Yellow Brown
- **Soils:** Cl – Clay, Lo – Loam, Si – Silt, Sa – Sand
- **Other:** / - Mottled, Grl – Gravel, Cbs – Cobbles, Pbs – Pebbles, Rts – Roots
Figure 3: Project location on the NRCS Web Soil Survey of Monroe County, New York
(*note – GIS street labels are slightly shifted from actual locations)
3.2 Sites within a One Mile Radius

Archaeological site files checks were conducted at the Rochester Museum & Science Center’s Regional Heritage Preservation Program (RMSC/RHPP) and at the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (NYSOPRHP). The site files checks identified seventeen individual archaeological sites within 1.6 km (1 mi) of the project area. Of the EuroAmerican archaeological sites, two are industrial, one is a cemetery, one is commercial/industrial, and two are of the house/cabin type. There are two prehistoric Native American campsites, one prehistoric stray find, two prehistoric cemetery/burial, one Early Woodland/Middle Woodland village, one Late Woodland/Historic Native American village, one Woodland/Historic Native American village, and one Historic Native American/Iroquois village. In addition, there is one campsite, one ceremonial site, and one house/cabin of Historic Native American affiliation.

As noted in Table 2, RMSC Roc 137 is the closest site to the project area and is adjacent to the NE corner of the APE at the intersection of East Avenue and E. Main Street. RMSC Roc 137 is noted in Follett’s unpublished manuscript as a small village of huts observed in 1819, located at the “junction of the north and south trail and a trail from the southeast that is now East Avenue and Franklin Street . . . (near) the Great Falls Gah-sko-lo wa-neh.” No archaeological sites are noted within or immediately adjacent to the project APE.

Table 2: Archaeological Sites within a One-Mile Radius of the Project Area.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NYSOPRHP Site #</th>
<th>Additional Site #</th>
<th>Distance from APE m (ft)</th>
<th>Time Period</th>
<th>Site Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 041</td>
<td>1463 m (4800 ft) SW</td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>Cemetery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NYSM 2539</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 044</td>
<td>640 m (2100 ft) SW</td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>House/Cabin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NYSM 8721</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 071</td>
<td>610 m (2000 ft) SW</td>
<td>Historic Native American</td>
<td>Campsite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Follett 301</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Parker MNRO 37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 077</td>
<td>152 m (500 ft) W</td>
<td>Woodland/Historic Native American</td>
<td>Village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 078</td>
<td>91 m (300 ft) N</td>
<td>Historic Native American</td>
<td>House/Cabin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 085</td>
<td>1066 m (3500 ft) SW</td>
<td>Historic Native American</td>
<td>Ceremonial</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 (cont): Archaeological Sites within a One-Mile Radius of the Project Area.

|   | Site Code     | Repository Location | Distance (meters) | Type                      | Feature
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>A055-40-1554</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 137, NYSM 3923, Follett 102, Parker MNRO 73</td>
<td>Adjacent, NW Corner 762 m (2500 ft) SW</td>
<td>Historic Native American/Iroquois</td>
<td>Village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>A055-40-1550</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 151, Follett 301</td>
<td>335 m (1100 ft) W</td>
<td>Late Woodland/ Historic Native American</td>
<td>Village/Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>A055-40-1551</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 152, Follett 303</td>
<td>915 m (3000 ft) SE</td>
<td>Undifferentiated Prehistoric</td>
<td>Burial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>A055-40-1557</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 168, NYSM 2538, Follett 366</td>
<td>915 m (3000 ft) SE</td>
<td>Undifferentiated Prehistoric</td>
<td>Burial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>A055-40-0014</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 258</td>
<td>793 m (2600 ft) NW</td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>Industrial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>A055-40-1393</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 261</td>
<td>335 m (1100 ft) W</td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>Industrial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>A055-40-1393</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 280</td>
<td>335 m (1100 ft) W</td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>Industrial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>A055-40-1393</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 331, NYSM 8722</td>
<td>335 m (1100 ft) W</td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>Commercial/Industrial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>A055-40-1393</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 332, NYSM 7118, Parker MNRO 73C</td>
<td>335 m (1100 ft) W</td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>Commercial/Industrial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>A055-40-1393</td>
<td>RMSC Roc 333, NYSM 7117, Parker MNRO 73B</td>
<td>335 m (1100 ft) W</td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>Commercial/Industrial</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the information summarized below in Table 3 as well as environmental variables, it would appear that the most likely site types that could be expected within the project area would be a campsite or village of Native American cultural affiliation. The project area is located near the Genesee River, placing it in a very auspicious location for accessing many desired faunal, floral, and lithic resources. Native American cemeteries are noted nearby but their locations are known and no burials have been noted during prior earth moving within the APE, therefore none are expected to be present within the project area. Perhaps most relevant however are the commercial and industrial structures and associated outbuildings dating prior to 1875, which were located within the APE, indicating a high likelihood for recovering historic artifacts. These projections are tempered by the complete destruction of any existing soils during the construction of the monolithic structure of Midtown and its associated underground parking, service roads, and foundations/basements. No original soils capable of containing intact cultural materials exist anywhere within the APE.
Table 3: Summary of Known Archaeological Sites by Cultural Affiliation and Site Type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural Affiliation</th>
<th>Site Type</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Ceremonial</th>
<th>Campsite</th>
<th>Stray Find</th>
<th>Cemetery/ Burial</th>
<th>House/ Cabin</th>
<th>Industrial</th>
<th>Commercial</th>
<th>Industrial</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prehistoric</td>
<td>Undifferentiated Prehistoric</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 (29%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Early/Middle Woodland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 (6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Late Woodland/ Historic Native American</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 (6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Woodland/ Historic Native American</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 (6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historic</td>
<td>Historic Native American/ Iroquois</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 (6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Historic Native American</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3 (18%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Historic EuroAmerican</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 (29%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>4 (24%)</td>
<td>1 (6%)</td>
<td>3 (18%)</td>
<td>1 (6%)</td>
<td>3 (18%)</td>
<td>2 (12%)</td>
<td>2 (12%)</td>
<td>1 (6%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>17 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.3 Historic Development of APE

The aims of this historic map review are to establish potential historic-period archaeological resources that may be disturbed as a result of the proposed project and to identify areas where soil disturbance is least likely to have occurred in the past. Since the project area is located in an urban landscape, which has experienced significant changes through time, it is important to focus on areas which have either been untouched by development or have been encapsulated, via a parking lot or road, at an early stage. The proposed project area encompasses one very large urban block and is presently a single monolithic building composed of five joined buildings including the McCurdy building, the B. Forman Building, the Seneca Building, the plaza and terrace level of Midtown Mall, and the Midtown Tower. The construction of these building with their associated foundations, basements, underground parking, and underground service road supplying the entire block as well as the Chase Building opposite the mall on South Clinton Avenue to the west has removed any possibility of locating intact culture bearing soil deposits within the APE.

Now follows the more detailed discussion of the changes that have been noted within the APE since 1875 based on map evidence. Figures 4-14 which are the basis for this discussion are located in Appendix B. Although the identification of map documented structure (MDS) locations is a desired outcome of this historical research, it became obvious that it is not entirely possible to identify whether structures were removed or simply incorporated into later structures. Therefore, only in cases where it is clearly evident that a structure has been removed and not incorporated into a later structure was an MDS location identified. Additionally, as the APE bisects historic property boundaries, it also bisects only a portion of the footprint of many structures. In order to reduce complexity in describing change through time, if the APE boundary intersects any portion of a structure it will be considered within the APE.

On the 1875 Hopkins Plat Map of Rochester (Figure 4) there are approximately 75 discrete structures within the APE including several streets not visible today including Lancaster St. (the name is changed to Cortland St. sometime between 1875 and 1892), running north-south through the center of the APE, and an extension of Elm St. in the eastern portion of the APE. On Figure 4, structure divisions are denoted by both solid and dashed lines and crosshatching. It appears that the majority of the structures within the APE are single family residences with associated stables or garages. The most notable structures in the APE are the Universalist Church on S. Clinton Ave. and the 3rd Presbyterian Church Chapel along the now absent Temple Street under the route of E. Broad St. By 1892 (Figure 5), many structures appear modified and incorporated into new structures. Several new structures have been
added as well, including several single family residences and small storage sheds. MDSs A – F are designated to represent residences and other structures that have been removed or replaced. Additionally, the Lyceum Theatre has been added along S. Clinton Ave. along with some new businesses near E. Main St. including a furniture store, a plumber, a chemist, several hotels, and the Laney and Barker Co. wrapping paper dealers.

Between 1892 and 1900 (Figure 6), the number of individual structures appears to decrease to 63. This is due in part to the incorporation of previous structures into larger conglomerates. By 1912 (Figure 7), the number of discrete structures has fallen to 59, with further incorporation into monolithic single structures likely. The use of the structures between 1875 and 1912 reflects the increasing urbanization and technological change within the country as a whole. MDSs G – M were designated to represent residences that were removed along Elm and Cortland St. and residences removed in the northwestern corner of the APE along S. Clinton Ave. that were replaced with the Hotel Seneca. The 3rd Presbyterian Church along Temple St. has been replaced by the Unitarian Church Sunday School, while many other structures have been repurposed for service business use. These businesses include the American Glass Co., the Elm Bowling Hall, the Rochester Delivery Co., a tailor shop, a trucking business, a dry cleaners, a plumber, and several restaurants. The most notable change between 1900 and 1912 is the addition of the McCurdy & Norwell Company Department Store along E. Main Street.

The 1918 Hopkins map (Figure 8) shows some change since 1912. MDSs N – U were designated to represent several buildings that were replaced while the total number of discrete structures had fallen to approximately 49. The largest changes within the APE include a name change from the McCurdy & Norwell Co. to the McCurdy & Robinson Co. Department Store and the addition of the B. Forman Company Department Store along S. Clinton Ave. Also of interest is the addition of several large garages, the Peoples Outfitting Co., and the New England Furniture & Carpet Co.

The period between 1918 and 1926 (Figure 9) shows moderate change, with most structures remaining similar in shape and design while the total number of structures had fallen to 28 from the 49 previously noted. Increasing building consolidation has resulted in the designation of MDSs V – Z and Z1 – Z7. The rise of department stores is evident with the expansion of the McCurdy & Co. Department Store and the B. Forman Co. Ladies Apparel Department Store. Further urbanization is noted with additional garages, shopping, and several realty companies now located within the APE.

The period between 1926 and 1938 (Figure 10) shows significant change, with huge numbers of structures being replaced by surface parking lots with the total number of structures falling to 12 from the 28 previously noted. Increasing building consolidation has resulted in the designation of MDSs Z8 – Z21. McCurdy’s and B. Forman’s department store have further expanded. The majority of the APE is now made up of covered garages, surface automobile parking, and many gas stations.

An aerial photograph from 1951 (Figure 11) demonstrates the expansion of parking lots in the APE with very little change evident from 1938. The aerial photograph from 1970 (Figure 12) shows significant change between 1951 and 1970. Midtown Plaza was built in the early 1960’s and is considered the world’s first indoor mall. This new monolithic building resulted in the abandonment of Cortland Street and portions of Elm Street. The APE as it exists today is evident in this aerial photograph including the Midtown Tower and bus depot in the southeastern section of the APE.

The aerial photograph from 1993 (Figure 13) demonstrates significant change surrounding the APE, however change within the APE is minimal, as the entirety of the APE is Midtown Plaza. The aerial photograph from 2005 (Figure 14) demonstrates further change surrounding the APE, but little change within the APE. Of interest is the modern building development and associated new roads and parking garages southwest of the APE.
IV. SENSITIVITY ASSESSMENT

4.1 Prehistoric site sensitivity

The prehistoric site sensitivity, based on integration of environmental information, site file data, overview, and current land use/disturbances, is estimated to be low. There are 12 individual prehistoric sites recorded within a 1.6 km (1 mi) radius of the current project area. The Genesee River is just west of the project area, providing a permanent and potable water source. Moreover, there are multiple resources in the lowlands next to the river, for items such as food, clay, and plants. These attributes would suggest a high sensitivity for the potential of a prehistoric site being located within the APE. Table 3 indicates that the most likely type of prehistoric site to be encountered within the project area would be a village or campsite, however, this is tempered by the complete destruction of original soils within the entire extent of the APE during the construction of the Midtown complex. Without the existing disturbance within the APE, the prehistoric sensitivity would have been considered high. This disturbance will be discussed in depth below in Section V.

4.2 Historic site sensitivity

Based upon historic map results and information about settlement prior to the documentation of historic maps, the project APE would have a low potential for historic site sensitivity. There are 5 historic sites located within 1.6 km (1 mi) of the project area. But more importantly, the project area is located within an urban city block which saw heavy development predating 1875 and significant change between 1875 and today (Figures 2 through 15). The construction of the large scale buildings that are known today as the Midtown complex resulted in the complete destruction of possibly culture bearing soils within the APE and limits the historic site sensitivity to low, where without this disturbance it would have been average.

V. TYPE AND EXTENT OF DISTURBANCE

It is clear from the diachronic map study that the soils within the Midtown APE have been completely destroyed by the construction of the large-scale buildings and associated subsurface structure that composes the Midtown complex. One hundred percent of the APE is currently occupied by buildings whose foundations, underground garages, and service roads extended well into subsoil, precluding the potential for original soil deposits to exist at these locations. The identification of these soils as Urban Land is accurate. Additionally, the complete lack of undisturbed soils within the APE precludes the need for Phase IB testing.

VI. TESTING RECOMMENDATIONS

Based upon the results of the map research and site visits to date, no Phase IB work is recommended for the Midtown Site. The complete destruction of any possible culture bearing soils has taken place during the construction of the existing Midtown complex and precluded the need for Phase IB testing.
VII. REFERENCES

---------


Harris, George H.

Hopkins, G.M.


Sanborn Map Company


United States Department of Agriculture
1973  Soil Survey of Monroe County, New York in cooperation with the Cornell University Agricultural Experiment Station. Washington, D.C.

United States Department of Agriculture
Natural Resources Conservation Service, National Cooperative Soil Survey, Web Soil Survey

United States Department of Agriculture
Soil Survey Staff, Natural Resources Conservation Service, United States Department of Agriculture. Official Soil Series Descriptions [Online WWW]. Available URL:

United States Geological Survey

www.mappingmonroe.org
Monroe County GIS Services Department – Historic Aerial Photography

www.nysgis.state.ny.us
NYS GIS Data Depot – Current Aerial Photography
APPENDIX A
Photographs
Photograph 1: General Midtown APE and McCurdy Building along Euclid St., from the corner of Euclid St. and E. Main St., facing south

Photograph 2: General Midtown APE and McCurdy Building along E. Main St., from the corner of Euclid St. and E. Main St., facing west
Photograph 3: General Midtown APE and current Citizens Bank Building (not part of APE), from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Main St., facing southeast

Photograph 4: General Midtown APE along S. Clinton Ave., from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Main St., facing south
Photograph 5: General Midtown APE and Seneca Building along S. Clinton Ave., facing east

Photograph 6: General Midtown APE and B. Forman Building along S. Clinton Ave., facing east
Photograph 7: General Midtown APE from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Broad St., facing north

Photograph 8: General Midtown APE from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Broad St., facing northeast
Photograph 9: General Midtown APE from the corner of S. Clinton Ave. and E. Broad St., facing east

Photograph 10: General Midtown APE along E. Broad St., facing northwest
Photograph 11: General Midtown APE along E. Broad St., facing north

Photograph 12: General Midtown APE along E. Broad St., facing northeast
Photograph 13: General Midtown APE along Atlas St., facing west

Photograph 14: General Midtown APE and underground service road access along Atlas St., facing north
Photograph 15: General Midtown APE along Atlas St., facing southwest

Photograph 16: General Midtown APE along Euclid St., facing northwest
APPENDIX B
Midtown Figures 4-14
Figure 4: Midtown APE on Plate 7 of the 1875 Hopkins Map of Rochester, New York
Figure 5: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1892 Sanborn Map of Rochester, New York
Figure 6: Midtown APE and MDS locations on Plates 5 and 6 of the 1900 Lathrop Plat Map of Rochester, New York
Figure 7: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1912 Sanborn Map of Rochester, New York
Figure 8: Midtown APE and MDS locations on Plate 2 of the 1918 Hopkins Plat Map of Rochester, New York
Figure 9: Midtown APE and MDS locations on Plate 2 of the 1926 Hopkins Plat Map of Rochester, New York
Figure 10: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1938 Sanborn Map of Rochester, New York
Figure 11: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1951 aerial photograph of the City of Rochester.
Figure 12: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1970 aerial photograph of the City of Rochester.
Figure 13: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the 1993 aerial photograph of the City of Rochester.
Figure 14: Midtown APE and MDS locations on the April 2005 aerial photograph of the City of Rochester.